

## TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORT

Division: Urban Social Development and Public  
Management Division

TA No., Country and Name			Amount Approved: \$450,000	
TA 7910-REG: Solid Waste Management in the Pacific			Revised Amount: n/a	
Executing Agency: Asian Development Bank (ADB)		Source of Funding: TASF-other sources (\$425,000) and TASF-IV (\$25,000)	Amount Undisbursed: \$17,899.59	Amount Utilized: \$432,100.41
TA Approval Date:	TA Signing Date:	Fielding of First Consultants:	TA Completion Date	
15 November 2011	15 November 2011	3 May 2012	Original: 30 November 2013	Actual: 30 June 2014
			Account Closing Date	
			Original: 30 November 2013	Actual: 30 September 2014
<b>Description</b>				
<p>Municipal solid waste management (SWM) in Pacific developing member countries (DMCs) is inadequate to effectively handle growing volumes of solid waste generated by urbanization and rising incomes. The SWM situation in Pacific DMCs is contributing to increased public health risks and degradation of the surrounding urban environment. Collection service coverage is low in most urban centers, particularly in informal settlements and peri-urban areas, resulting in illegal dumping and burning of waste. The sector is also characterized by weak governance resulting in poor accountability for service delivery, unclear institutional roles and responsibilities, low levels of enforcement, and a lack of financial sustainability. The rationale for the TA is in line with ADB's <i>Pacific Approach 2009-2014</i>, which recognizes the need to improve the supply and delivery of solid waste services in the Pacific. The TA scope was also guided by priorities outlined in the <i>Pacific Regional Solid Waste Management Strategy 2010-2015</i>.</p>				
<b>Expected Impact, Outcome and Outputs</b>				
<p>The expected impact of the TA was to improve delivery of SWM. The expected outcome was that key stakeholders (government, private sector, and civil society) in Pacific DMCs have an increased understanding of SWM issues in the Pacific. The TA was structured into 4 outputs: (i) an update of the current situation in the SWM sector in Pacific DMCs, (ii) agreement of Pacific DMCs on outline proposals for pilot investments, (iii) sharing of Pacific DMC stakeholder experiences on SWM issues, and (iv) dissemination of SWM knowledge products.</p>				
<b>Delivery of Inputs and Conduct of Activities</b>				
<p>All tasks outlined in the terms of reference (ToR) were delivered by national and international consultants on schedule. The original TA design provided for an implementation period of 24 months, with 9 person-months of input from a single international consultant, and 1 person-month each from 14 individual national consultants in every Pacific DMC. The TA experienced implementation delays because of difficulties identifying a suitable international consultant to travel to all Pacific DMCs within the required timeframe. A minor change in implementation arrangements was approved so that 4 international consultants were instead recruited to provide 2.25 person-months of input each. The ToR are assessed as adequate to provide all of the necessary inputs to achieve the expected outputs and outcome, however, to complete all required tasks, contract variations were needed to provide an average of 18 additional days of input per international consultant. While this resulted in a small reduction in productivity, the inputs provided in the original TA design may have been insufficient, given the time needed to collect baseline data, conduct stakeholder consultations, organize a regional workshop, prepare reports and presentations, and travel to 14 Pacific DMCs.</p>				
<p>The relative cost of the inputs, even with additional person-days required during implementation, can be considered relatively low given the large number of countries covered by the TA and the wide scope of the ToR. The use of national consultants to support data collection and logistics in each country helped to minimize input costs. Consultant performance ranged from exceptional in the case of four national consultants, to generally satisfactory for one national consultant, with the majority of consultants assessed as performing satisfactorily, among those consultants who were rated.</p>				
<p>During the regional workshop, clients expressed their satisfaction with SWM investigations carried out under the TA which resulted in the collection and dissemination of up-to-date sector information. As the executing agency for the</p>				

TA, ADB's performance was satisfactory. Two ADB review missions were conducted to review TA progress.

#### **Evaluation of Outputs and Achievement of Outcome**

The consultants produced high quality reports, however these were written in technical language, and each consultant had adopted a different style of writing, despite the use of a standard reporting format. The majority of TA outputs were produced efficiently, with the exception of knowledge products which required significant additional input from the ADB project officer supported by an editor to prepare 3 thematic brochures describing technical, financial, and institutional aspects of SWM in the region, as well as 14 brochures which presented details on the SWM sector in each Pacific DMC. However, the number of publications produced was significantly higher than the 2 knowledge products envisioned during TA design.

The TA outputs are assessed to have been achieved based on the indicators included in the design and monitoring framework. The TA reports provided detailed and up-to-date assessments of the SWM situation in each Pacific DMC, covering financial, technical and institutional aspects. The pilot investment project outlines to improve SWM in each Pacific DMC were discussed and agreed to by stakeholders in each country. A regional workshop was held in November 2012 with representatives from 9 Pacific DMCs, provided an opportunity for participants to discuss common SMW issues, and learn about best practices from around the region. The TA outputs were widely disseminated through knowledge products. At the time of TA closing, the knowledge products had been downloaded from ADB's website 353 times.

While most of the identified SWM pilot investments were too small to be developed into project concepts suitable for ADB financing, this was not an explicit objective of the TA. However, in Timor-Leste, engagement through TA resulted in the approval of a SWM project preparatory technical assistance in 2014. In Fiji, the government was able to use its own resources to successfully undertake detailed design of the pilot investment identified through the TA.

Since the TA outputs contributed directly to the improved understanding of SWM issues among key stakeholders in Pacific DMCs, the TA outcome is assessed to have been achieved. Pacific DMC officials involved in TA implementation expressed satisfaction with events and knowledge products produced under the TA.

The production of knowledge products took a significant amount of time which was not anticipated during TA design. This required a 7-month extension in the original TA closing date.

#### **Overall Assessment and Rating**

The TA is rated as successful. The TA successfully contributed to the body of knowledge on SWM in Pacific DMCs, and helped to promote greater awareness on SWM issues in the region. The TA outcome is also considered to be sustainable. Knowledge gathered and disseminated under the TA has been used to: (i) design follow-on SWM investments to Pacific DMCs by both ADB and other development partners; (ii) inform the work of researchers studying SWM issues in Pacific DMCs, and (iii) develop detailed case studies on successful and innovative SWM approaches to include in the upcoming Global Waste Management Outlook.

#### **Major Lessons**

Given the large number of consultants recruited under the TA, and the need to consolidate outputs into knowledge products suitable for publication, recruitment of consultants through a single firm could have reduced TA implementation delays and minimized the burden of administering a large number of consulting services contracts.

#### **Recommendations and Follow-Up Actions**

ADB should continue its engagement in the SWM sector by actively exploring opportunities to provide follow-on assistance in Pacific DMCs, as appropriate, during country programming discussions with Pacific DMCs.

Prepared by: Allison Woodruff

Designation: Urban Development Specialist, PAUS

In preparing any country program or strategy, financing any project, or by making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area in this document, the Asian Development Bank does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.